Héloïse Baldelli

Faculty of Performing Arts, University of Stavanger

https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4789-5054

heloise.baldelli@uis.no

HIP as a Creative Tool for Performance Design:

Investigating the Performance Practice of Satie's Mélodies to Challenge the Stereotypes of the Art Song Recital

ARTICLE ABSTRACT

In the 20th century, most artistic disciplines underwent a wave of experimentation and discussion, but classical music performance as an artistic practice remained relatively untouched. In the area of vocal chamber music, the traditional recital format with the singer standing by the piano is still the standard. In their doctoral research project, the author aims to challenge and explore alternatives to this traditional format. They start by investigating the original performance practice of Satie's mélodies to then design three different performances of French early 20th century art songs using various artistic methods and theoretic concepts. The first one is based on the approach known as historical informed performance (HIP). The author argues that Satie's mélodies, which are little known and seldom performed, are difficult to appreciate in a static recital. Investigating the original performance practice became a way to rediscover other aspects of the music beyond the dogmas of the score and find inspiration for creating alternative modes of presenting classical vocal chamber music. In this paper the author retraces the use of HIP as a creative tool for designing performances of art songs.

KEYWORDS

HIP as a Creative Tool for Performance Design:
Investigating the Performance Practice of Satie's Mélodies to Challenge the Stereotypes of the Art Song Recital

By: Héloïse Baldelli

HIP as a Creative Tool for Performance Design: Investigating the Performance Practice of Satie's Mélodies to Challenge the Stereotypes of the Art Song Recital

In the 20th century a wave of experimentation and discussion hit most artistic disciplines. As Dogantan-Dack (2015) points out, classical music has been slow to join in. Although composers have been experimenting with the musical language; classical music performance as an artistic practice has relatively stayed untouched. In the area of vocal chamber music, the traditional recital format with the singer standing by the piano and all the accompanying rituals is THE standard (Neher, 2011). It is what is expected by the public, taught in the educational institutions, and

reenforced by the "performing police (teachers, critics, bloggers) and . . . potential employers (agents, conductors, ensembles, venue managers, record and radio producers)" (Leech-Wilkinson, 2012, 3.3). According to Leech-Wilkinson, for example, the reasons why performers do not attempt non-traditional interpretation of classical musical works are largely economic and cultural. For starters, there is no real incentive in terms of career promotion for trying to offer a substantially different interpretation. Secondly, there is a very strong performance tradition which is supposed to ensure faithfulness to the composer's intentions. This claim is seductive and powerful as it appeals to our moral sense: after all performers of Western art music are usually dealing with the interpretation of someone else's creative work. It is also difficult to argue with since most often 'the source of the truth' (the composer) is not alive anymore. And the same considerations apply with regards to the format of the performance. But as Dogantan-Dack (2015) reminds us, artist-researchers have the opportunity, and with that I would add the responsibility too, of unmasking the "untruths" on which the system lies. And as it happens, our current performance practice of art songs does not preserve faithfully the performance tradition, as we are led to believe. For example, Loges and Tunbridge (2020) demonstrate that how we imagine a liederabend nowadays represents but an elitist and restricted view of this genre's

Concert in Ramsland stuen, Stavanger. 23 August 2022. Photo: E. Behrens.

multifaceted performance tradition. As Laura Tunbridge (p. 1) formulates eloquently: "In a generation in which the notion of period performance has become firmly established as a routine mode of interpretation, it is striking that many of our concert habits have little to do with known historical practices."

Restlessness against performing standards and the stereotype of 'the classical singer' is common among performers, as well as a desire to regain ownership over creative practices. Some singers take action by creating their own recording label (such as Marina Rebeka with Prima Classic), opera companies (Debi Wong with re:Naissance opera) and production companies (Sonya Yoncheva with SY11). In terms of performing styles, vocalists have been experimenting with genres and interdisciplinary practices. In the Norwegian panorama it is worth mentioning Tora Augestad (n.d.), working across cabaret and early music, Håkon Kornstad (2021), merging jazz saxophone and operatic singing, and dancer and singer Silje Aker Johnsen (2019), researching the physical interpretation of contemporary opera. Until now experimentation seems to have gone mostly in the direction of opera staging, cross-over genres, and new music.

Although less has happened in chamber music, we do find projects such as Art Sung, where narratives and visual art are used to present art songs in a dramatized version (Mucha, 2018). In Norway, the duo frankågunnar have dedicated themselves in the past few years to the reinterpretation of lieder, mainly those by Franz Schubert. They have both commissioned composers to rewrite some of the songs as well as create their own interpretation of the cycle Schwanegesang by stretching the musical material of each song in different directions (frankågunnar, n.d.). Bjarte Eike and the Barokksolistene have been experimenting for the last fifteen years with the use of theatre, improvisation and storytelling to create 'shows' featuring early music that often include vocalists (Eike, 2022). At the Norwegian Academy of Music,

Ingeborg Dalheim is conducting her research on Norwegian art songs as interpreted by Norwegian female singers at the turn of the century (Dalheim, 2021). In her project she challenges today's role of the score as the primary source of a musical work, by learning the repertoire, as well as the style and techniques, only by listening to historical recordings. My own research is situated in between Eike's and Dalheim's. I too research art songs from the early 20th century, although my focus is on Satie and other French modernist composers that belonged to the group Les nouveaux jeunes. But, although I carefully studied the historical recordings available, I did heavily rely on the scores to prepare the performance. Besides, my interest is not in the vocal aspects of the interpretation of this repertoire. Instead, as Bjarte Eike, I'm more curious about playing with the performance format and multimediality, bending the strict codes of the art song recital to find greater freedom of expression.

In my doctoral research project, I design three different performances of French early 20th century art songs using each time different artistic methods and theoretic concepts. The first one, concluded in August 2022, was based on the approach known as historical informed performance (HIP) and featured only music by Satie. The program (see Appendix A) included his last three cycles of mélodies as well as some of his cabaret songs. In this paper I retrace my experience of designing the performance and argue for a use of HIP as a creative tool to challenge the stereotypes of the art song recital.

Historical informed performance

In its early stages the goal of what is now known as HIP, was to achieve 'authenticity' in performing music from the past. By carefully studying primary and secondary sources (autograph scores, instrument treatises, composers' autobiographies etc.) performers and musicologists aimed to reconstruct how the music was truly played at the time it was composed (Lawson & Stowell, 1999). This view of HIP relates

to a modern concept of musical work and implies a hierarchic power relationship between composers and performers. Since the 19th century there has been a tendency to understand music as an independent object created by the composer, whose ideas would be faithfully portrayed in the score (Butt, 2015). Whereas the performer, whose function was to materialize the music for an audience unable to read scores, had to be in service of the composer's will (Cook, 2001) and at times even expected to actively suppress any form for individual interpretation (Elliott, 2006). This is particularly true in the case of the French musical scene in the early 20th century. Both singers such as Bathori (1998), Croiza (Bannerman, 1989), Bernac (1978) and composers such as Debussy (Bannerman, 1989), Ravel (Long, 1973) and Stravinsky (Dahl, 2022) were adamant about not allowing the performer's personality shine through and only sing what is written in the score. Stravinsky (1970) for example wrote: "The secret of perfection lies above all in his [the performer] consciousness of the law imposed upon him by the work he is performing" (p.132). It is clear he, like many of his colleagues, thought the relationship between composer and performer to be strongly hierarchical. However, one should resist the temptation of heedlessly applying these instructions from a contemporary perspective and remember instead to place them as well in their historical context. Thus, one would possibly understand them as an expression of the reaction against the excessive freedom and exaggerated sentimentality of Romanticism, and especially Italian opera (Elliott, 2006). Furthermore, listening to historical recordings from a contemporary standpoint, discrepancies are sometimes found between what the musicians advocated for and how they played (see for example Hubbel, 2019, for a comparison between the lectures and recordings of Reynaldo Hahn or Dahl, 2022, for an analysis of the discrepancies between Stravinsky's statements on execution and his practice as a musician).

In the last few decades, there has been much discussion about where music is to be found; whether in the

score, in the performance, or in the relationship between the two. Nicholas Cook (2001) advocates for the last hypothesis and suggests reading scores as scripts. This approach returns agency to the performer by transforming the score's role from that of a rigid master to a more flexible guideline. In that way, the power relationship between composer and performer shifts from a hierarchical one to a horizontal collaborative one. And it is within this view that my use of the HIP framework is situated.

Since its origins the HIP movement has been surrounded by a heated debate, focusing primarily on the claim for authenticity (see for example Kerman, 1985; Leech-Wilkinson, 1984; Taruskin, 1995). The paradox of how HIP is commonly used nowadays, and especially how it has informed music teaching in higher education, is that a movement born in reaction to performance standardization has brought a new form of canonization (Leech-Wilkinson, 2012). The canon doesn't rule only which compositions are worthy of being played but how they should be played too. The range of what is acceptable is quite limited and "creativity . . . , like freedom of speech, is welcomed so long as nobody is too upset" (Dogantan-Dack & Leech-Wilkinson, 2013). So, although we are not performing all kinds of music in the contemporary style anymore, we are expected to play it in the 'correct style' to be regarded as serious classical musicians. But this 'correct style' is once again an illusion, often an approximate and limited idea of the way music was performed at a specific time and place, arrived to us through an evolving and diversified performance tradition.

However, instead of focusing on the critiques brought against HIP, I find it most fruitful to look at its creative potential. For example, Goehr (1994, p. 284) calls it "a tool to look at performance tradition with new eyes", echoed by Butt (2001), who claims it "has opened up a wide range of possibilities for new ways of performing and hearing". Along the same lines, Rolfhamre (2022) advocates for a use of HIP as ongoing action and practice, rather than an aim in

itself. His arguments ultimately bring him to also suggest the possibility of an ethical agency of HIP: "it is the very historical artefact that, through contextualisation, makes other futures possible through active and conscious past-present relations" (p. 81). This is also my standpoint: my interest in studying the original performance practice (later referred as OPP) of Satie's vocal compositions is not with the aim to reproduce it as faithfully as possible, but instead to find in the 'old ways' of performing art songs inspiration to rejuvenate, or expand, the 'current ways'. And especially by paying more attention to the context.

In fact, nowadays the widespread current of thought views musical works as eternal abstract objects, existing outside of time and space (Kania, 2017). This perspective can lead to an idea of music as ahistorical: according to formalists the main characteristics of a composition are inherent to it and don't require contextualization to stay valid. However, Rivers & Weber (2011) point out how rhetorical texts exist within a specific context and propose a rhetorical ecology that "emphasizes the symbiotic nature of texts, including the way texts, events and feelings [emphasis added] influence or 'contaminate' one another" (p. 193). I would argue that the same applies to musical works, especially considering how in the modern understanding they share much with verbal texts (a well identifiable author, being preserved through a written document (Butt, 2015)). In the case of Satie, I find this concept particularly fitting: his mélodies might not always result convincing on their own, but they reveal to be incredibly interesting when placed within their rhetorical ecology. For example, how his whole musical career was permeated by feelings of rejection, craving for acceptance, ambiguity towards his work as a cabaret pianist (Myers, 1968; Whiting, 1999). And how his lifestyle revolved around creating the image of a serious composer: from his attentive choice of clothes to the publicity stunts he liked to pull off (Orledge, 2020). Thus, investigating the context, not only in which he lived and composed, but in which he presented his music as well, became

fundamental for me to imagine a performance of his songs.

Using HIP to design the performance

When describing the qualities of HIP, Butt (2001) identifies six common traits:
[1.] Use of instruments from the composer's own era; [2.] Use of performing techniques documented in the composer's era; [3.] Performance based on the implications of the original sources for a particular work; [4.] Fidelity to the composer's intentions for performance or to the type of performance a composer desired or achieved; [5.] An attempt to re-create the context of the original performance; and [6.] An attempt to re-create the musical experience of the original audience.

Because my approach to HIP is based on an understanding of music as a relationship between score and performance and as context bound, I have mostly worked with the three last traits 4-6. Furthermore, the first one doesn't apply to my case as singers cannot obviously change vocal cords. The second, using techniques from the composer's era, is not relevant to the scope of my project. Although it is useful knowing that the canons of beautiful singing are not unchanged, my research deals with the format and context of the performance rather than the qualities of the sound produced. The third trade, studying primary (scores, recordings...) and secondary (biographies, letters...) sources, was indeed a part of the process to prepare my interpretation of the repertoire. However, the results of this research are relevant to the current discussion only for their contribution in shedding some light on the OPP and will be therefore discussed in point four. The originality and individuality of Satie's performance practice lie instead within the composer himself and in the larger context; that is, the aspects related to traits 4-6. By the composer himself I mean his artistic interests, methods and beliefs, his collaborations, his influences, and the way he himself framed his work. And by the larger context I mean the environment in which his vocal works were performed at his

time: the socio-cultural status of his audience, the physical spaces, the format, and other elements of the OPP. I will now discuss how I used the last three traits in the design of the performance.

4) Fidelity to the composer's intentions for performance or to the type of performance a composer desired or achieved

On the matter of intentions Satie is a peculiar case. We have exhaustive knowledge on how other French composers of his time wanted their mélodies to be performed, both from direct sources and indirect ones (Bathori, 1998; Bernac, 1978; Garden & Biancolli, 1951). Regarding Satie however, I only found a few statements about his compositional ideas and language (Orledge, 1984), but nothing about performance style. In general, he seemed very occupied with simplicity and brevity (Mellers, 1942; Orledge, 1984). This is a recurrent element in his compositional style, almost his creative manifesto, and could be plausibly transferred to the performing style.

I have therefore chosen to look at Satie's purpose in composing. Clearly in this area of investigation it is not possible to find the truth, but merely offer probable and inevitably biased conjectures. As I am not a psychologist, I didn't attempt a study of his personality. Instead as a fellow musician I used my intuition, my practice and my empathy while studying the music and the relevant literature and came to the following conclusions. Despite his provocations and jokes (Potter, 2016), his actions throughout his life clearly showed a craving for appreciation as a 'serious composer'. How, conscious of his poor compositional technique, he enrolled at the Schola Cantorum as a 40-year-old published composer (Davis, 2007). How he so carefully branded himself and his appearance (Orledge, 2020) and turned his lacking technique into a style of simplicity. How ashamed he was of his work as a cabaret and music hall composer (Myers, 1968; Whiting, 1999). Therefore, I used his desire of recognition as a guide throughout my project and worked to present his lesser-known music in

such a way that the audience could appreciate it. To achieve that, I chose to adapt the elements of the OPP to the contemporary taste. This applied first and foremost to the purely musical element, specifically the fact that we performed the songs according to the current standard practice for this genre. It must be noted, however, that I did find inspiration in the recordings I analyzed (Satie, n.d., 1949a, 1949b, 1954b, 1954a, 1967, 1974, 2012) and incorporated in my own interpretation some of the stylistic elements that I found, such as for example greater emphasis on pronunciation, spoken sections or heavier use of chest voice. And the same applied to the other aspects of the performance: clothes, language, movements, food, attitude etc.

"Dance was the perfect medium for me

The OPP served as inspiration and integrated my own performance in an updated version, filtered through contemporary taste and my personal sensibility. If my goal is to raise awareness and appreciation of this composer's less known vocal works, performing his music in a way that is historically authentic (as much as that can ever be realized) but difficult to relate for a contemporary audience would have been as absurd as only speaking French to the public because that's what Satie did.

Although I did not find any explicit instructions about the type of performance he wished for his mélodies, from the knowledge we do have of how they were presented during his lifetime the following characteristics emerge:

•   Smaller venues, often not thought primarily as concert halls: art galleries/artists' ateliers, friends' homes, private salons, even a fashion store.

•   Collaboration with other artists, often close friends, was very important. Not only the poets that wrote the lyrics, but also the painters that designed the programs (Picasso, Matisse) and were showing their art at the performances (Orledge, 1990).

•   Intimate settings with close distance to the public and possibility to mingle. There is some information about how carefully he planned the musicians' positions for incidental music and the response he hoped for with his furniture music (Makomaska, 2019; Potter, 2015).

5) An attempt to re-create the context of the original performance; and 6) An attempt to re-create the musical experience of the original audience.

In the context of my project, trait number six was interpreted in its broader meaning: as a social and multisensory, rather than purely auditive, experience of a music performance. With this understanding, both traits are dealing with the setting of the event and as such I will discuss them together.

Butt's choice of the word "attempt" is particularly appropriate here, since in this area we can mostly rely on hypothesis and reconstruction. Essentially, I have used all the findings discussed before to understand how a performance of Satie's vocal music at his time could have been and then filled in the gaps with probable inferences. With this knowledge in mind, I have designed a performance inspired by the characteristic elements of the OPP but thought for the demographic that usually attends classical concerts in Norway nowadays; with a special attention on facilitating the reception of the music. I have focused on two aspects: to create a specific mood that I describe as homey, cozy and relaxed, and to give the audience the tools to connect to the musical material.

To realize the first aspect, I have made the following choices. All the venues were either private homes, or previously private homes turned into museums/event locations. I have chosen to arrange the space in a café setting with chairs surrounding small tables when possible, and to serve coffee and French inspired food.

I have used different tools to break the traditional distance between performers and the audience and to

Concert in Villa Tou, Tau. 22 May 2022. Photo: E. Behrens.

create intimacy. For example, the pianist and I were already in the room when the public arrived, greeting them, distributing programs, and serving coffee, as hosts in a private home would do. There was no spatial distance as there was no stage, and the audience was sitting very close to the performing space. There was also no clear time break for when the concert started, the pianist was already playing when the audience arrived. This was inspired by Satie's invention of furniture music, a music that is supposed to fill the space without taking attention (Potter, 2015). There was also no traditional entrance with bow and applause: instead, we just started introducing the concert and the performance developed organically from there. There were also no bows after each musical number, just an acknowledgement of the public's applause. And at the end we did not exit the stage but remained in the room available for conversation.

We also used various devices to signify that the mood of this performance was unformal and relaxed: our appearance was elegant **but simple, our way of addressing the audience friendly and colloquial, and we avoided too many facts and technical information to the vantage of anecdotes and colorful descriptions.** In general, we tried to keep our attitudes and body language as relaxed and open as possible. We also encouraged explicitly the audience to relax, feel free to react and ask questions. This last point was, as expected, less successful as it requires confidence from the public. Nonetheless it was our experience that compared to most recitals we have been involved in their attitude while listening to us was significantly less intense and serious.

The other tools we employed to attempt to recreate the original context and audience's experience were narratives and visual aspects. We used narratives to paint a picture for the audience: I wanted them to be able to imagine the spaces, the personalities and the culture that surrounded those performances. And I wanted them to learn a little about Satie's complex personality and artistic endeavors. His mélodies are very peculiar and it takes time

and effort to appreciate them: they are so incredibly short, condensed in their simplicity and lack catchy melodies. My hypothesis was that a key in connecting to them is to understand a bit about the composer and the occasions they were written for.

Visual aspects were used not only in terms of the choice of clothes, but also in the form of props and dance/ movement to illustrate the essence of the songs without having to translate them. I chose to avoid printed translations as I find them distracting, forcing the public to alternate reading and looking at the performance. Most of these songs are also impossible to translate effectively as they rely heavily on word puns and cultural references. Instead, I explained very shortly the theme of each song and translated a few key words. The audience did get a printed program though, consisting of a map with the venues, the names of the people mentioned and the titles of the songs. The props and the dancing elements were inspired by the cabaret tradition, which played an extremely important part in Satie's life and artistic development.

Afternoon Tea
by Ingeborg Anzjøn
at Fira, Sandnes.
Photo: E. Behrens,
2022.

The multimedia aspect was also central in Satie's production, as he worked with artists from numerous disciplines (Orledge, 2020), was a prolific writer (Potter, 2016) and even collaborated with Man Ray on his first readymade (Orledge, 1995). As such, I wanted to include it in the performance. Partly this was accomplished through the choice of venues, three of which hosted art exhibitions, but I also wanted it to be an active part of my practice.

Dance was the perfect medium for me, as I trained as a dancer previously to studying music, and a key element of the cabaret and music-hall tradition. Working with his popular songs had also the additional function of allowing me to better understand his serious music. Because this type of work had such a big influence on the development of his musical language (Perloff, 1993; Potter, 2016; Whiting, 1999), it was important for me to experience performing it to gain a deeper insight into his mélodies.

Documenting the performance

The focus of this artistic research project was on the performer's experience rather than on that of the audience. Borrowing terms from social sciences one could say that I was the test subject and the public, although a fundamental component of the experiment, was not. From our observation the audience's demographic seemed to match that of most classical singing concerts we perform or have performed in the past and that allowed us to make some relevant comparisons. My goal however was to investigate how my version of an art song recital would affect my own experience of success in performing. Consequently, I focused on my perspective as a singer and my subjective experience of the audience's reactions while singing. Namely, I was interested in the audience mainly in their function as co-creators of the performance and part of the context that I am exploring. With their general mood and continuous feedback, also known

as "feedback loop", they affect the performers and contribute to shaping the performance (Fischer-Lichte, 2008). This perspective led me in the choice of the tools I used to document the experiment.

==Registering the experience of a live performance in a satisfying manner and preserving it for later analysis was a complicated task.== To build as comprehensive a picture as possible I decided to employ a multitude of methods and media. First, each performance was video recorded: five of them with a fixed camera and no post-editing. The audience was mostly out of the frame, although it is possible to hear their reactions such as laughter. This served as a sort of objective and impersonal documentation of the action happening on stage. However much of the 'live' element of the performance was lost and as such videorecording with a fixed angle proved to be a poor medium. Nonetheless it still resulted in some interesting discoveries: for example, some reactions from the audience that I had not noticed or elements of the performance that looked or sounded quite different from how I had experienced them. One of the performances was documented by a videographer who used three cameras. The different angles and close-ups give a better impression of the details and facial expressions happening during the performance, although still from an external rather than participatory point of view.

Secondly all performances (except for one, due to sickness) were also documented through photos. Here the selection of the photographer was given much thought: the choice fell on someone who is also a performing musician and sound engineer. He is experienced in taking pictures of singers in live performances and is particularly skilled at capturing their expressions at crucial points in the music. His photos represent simultaneously the point of view of a colleague, a member of the audience and a visual artist. He also documented the venues as well as other elements that could convey the atmosphere of the events, with a special focus on the differences between the performances. Al-

though the photos do a better job at portraying these aspects than the videos, they still don't capture the elements of shared experience and energy flow happening in live performances.

To save at least traces of the performers' experience we used video diaries. The pianist and I did each a short self-video-interview after every performance to recollect our own impressions as well as reactions and comments from the audience. The questions (see Appendix B) were the same for the both of us and were loosely based on a study by Radbourne et al. (2009) which investigates audience experience as a possible factor in assessing the quality of a performance. In my own project I consider instead the performers' experience as an indicator of the performance's success. However, I found that two of the criteria that the study identified as valued by the audience, authenticity and collective engagement, are also crucial to my own satisfaction and feeling of success as a performer. This is perhaps not so surprising when we consider that the study also shows how collective engagement is valued by the audience not only in terms of interaction between members of the audience but also between them and the performers (Radbourne et al., 2009). Suggesting that part of the appeal of a live performance is its characteristic of being a shared communicative experience amongst all present. Therefore, I was able to use these parameters in my study and the questions focused primarily on issues of authenticity, in this specific case "existential authenticity" defined as "a special state of Being in which one is true to oneself" (Wang, 1999, p.358, as cited in Radbourne et al., 2009). Along with matters of collective engagement; not only amongst members of the audience, but between the performers too as well as between them and the audience.

I decided not to use questionnaires to investigate the audience's experience as it would have activated their rational thinking and placed them in a critical role, which was not the point of the experiment as mentioned before. However, I considered the spontaneous comments they chose to share with us unprompted to be a part of the interaction that is a distinctive quality of live performance. Consequently, I not only recorded them in the video diaries, but I also saved all comments received on social media afterwards. These different documents, alongside my memory of the experience, constitute the material on which the following reflection is based.

Analyzing the performance

Using the HIP framework as a tool led me to design a performance that was quite different from the stereotypical art song recital. There was no extreme change, as the goal of the experiment was not necessarily to create something radically different but to critically examine the different elements of the recital in light of the OPP. This process led me to make subtle variations that although challenged the traditional format didn't go as far as to break the communicational agreement, as Rolfhamre (2022) describes the alignment between musicians' performative choices and public's expectations. The performance was advertised as a concert of classical vocal chamber music and was still clearly recognizable as such. The positive reactions and comments we received are taken as a sign that the audience did accept the validity of the performance. That was partly possible because we kept the musical element untouched and partly because the new elements I introduced, although not typical of a recital, would still result familiar to a contemporary audience: most would have encountered them in other performance genres such as opera, music hall, musical theatre, opera cafés and other. These elements though did contribute significantly to a shift in the atmosphere compared to what I have experienced when performing vocal chamber music in a more traditional way. The audience often allowed themselves to express their appreciation beyond the customary clapping, towards more vocal and spontaneous reactions: from laughter and lively facial expressions all the way to comments and cheering.

The differences can roughly be grouped in three areas of intervention. The main one was how I used the performing space: looking at it with the eyes of a stage director and a choreographer led me to utilizing it in its totality, instead of just singing in a fixed position. This, as well as using props and gestures/movements, communicated the mood of the songs without much need for explaining the texts. This aspect seems to have struck a chord with the audience, as it has been one of the most recurring comments from them. They appreciated the variation and liveliness it brought to a classical concert.

Although the mélodies were performed in a more traditional static way, relying mostly on a few gestures or steps, the cabaret songs were freer: from full dancing to something in between a choreography and a staged scene. Either way movement provided a non-textual visual aid for the audience in encountering unfamiliar and somewhat difficult musical material. It has been shown (Madison & Schiölde, 2017, Van Den Bosch et al., 2013) that nowadays audiences are more inclined to listen to and appreciate familiar music, be it a known tune or music composed with simple harmonies, singable melodies and repetitions. Satie's mélodies have little of that and even his cabaret songs, although I chose the most singable ones, rely heavily on the understanding of the texts to be fully appreciated. The movements, alongside the context and anecdotes I provided before each piece, gave the audience a way into the music. Dancing had also the additional effect of helping me perform. Singing while standing still by the piano has never felt comfortable to me. In the past, every time I had the chance to perform roles that allowed for dancing, I was able to achieve greater freedom and expressivity. Therefore, experimenting with how to include this aspect in the vocal chamber music repertoire is an important aspect of my research. From the recordings of the performances I have analyzed, as well as from how I perceived it, the dancing allowed me to achieve a different expressive quality with my voice. The other difference was chal-

Tapestry by Frida Hansen, reproduction.
Photo: E. Behrens, 2022.

Concert in a private home, Randaberg. 22 August 2022.

Concert in Ramslandstuen, Stavanger. 23 August 2022.
Photo both left and right: E. Behrens.

lenging the rituals of the classical concert: welcoming the audience in person in a homey space and serving food instantly broke the religious silence usually observed. That in turn made the public more inclined to react with laughter and other vocal expressions. Another indicator of this correlation was that the one performance which was in a less cozy room, where I did not personally greet the public, and where only coffee but no food was served, provoked fewer reactions. Almost no laughing, and an impassive facial expression of the audience made it in turn harder for me to perform. In this case the feedback-loop mentioned earlier had a negative effect on me and on the performance. Especially when tackling comical repertoire and in intimate settings, I find the audience's role in feeding back energy into the performance with their reactions to be very important. While being met with silence and a wall of blank faces is extremely draining for me. From my video diary: "My impression was the audience was colder than in the other concerts. They were not showing anything in their facial expression. The audience was very hard to read. Collective engagement between the members of the audience was very poor. Between performers and audience also I didn't feel there was much engagement. That can be because of the venue. It was a colder environment; it wasn't as warm and cozy as the other three venues." (H. Baldelli, personal communication, July 4, 2022, 1:14). From the pianist's video diary: "The audience reaction today felt differently . . . the room it was… it was a nice place, but it didn't feel as cozy and inviting as some of the other places and yeah today there seemed to be more of a traditional distance." (F. Wildschütz, personal communication, June 26, 2022, 4:18).

The third difference was blurring the line between my role as a host and as a performer. Greeting the public and addressing them directly, as well as the intimate size of the venues, created a physical closeness between us. Alternating being 'myself' in the narrative sections and impersonating a character in the singing sections, gave them a

chance to know me a little bit as a person. Overall, being able to step out of the 'role' as a classical singer made it easier for me to stay relaxed and open while singing, which allowed for a freer and more generous communication of the musical material to the audience. Authenticity in this case was understood as a (real or perceived) quality of the performer rather than faithfulness to the primary sources. In the context of HIP, authenticity is traditionally connected with facts: finding out as much as possible about the original performances and, putting aside the performer's personal style, attempting to reproduce them as faithfully as possible. In my own use of HIP, I studied the sources to get as good an idea as possible of the intention behind the compositions and the mood of the performances. And these are the qualities I tried to stay authentic to: simple songs about banal subjects, written to amuse, tease and surprise, to be performed at social events amongst friends or for small audiences. This process in turn allowed me to be authentic to myself as a performer. Away with the romantic myth of the beautiful singer in gorgeous clothes and jewelry, drifting on and off a faraway stage without a spoken word. Just my simple self, in normal clothes and imperfect Norwegian speaking, sharing the music that I love and a piece of myself with the audience. In conclusion, using the HIP framework as a tool rather than a goal transformed a performance of art songs from static to dynamic, from solemn to relaxed, from religiously quiet to slightly noisy, from formal to cozy. And this allowed energy to flow freely between the performers, between them and the audience and between the musical work and the performers. Being able to use the performing space, from as little as taking a few steps away from the piano to a full waltz gave me the necessary freedom to experience the music through my whole body. Encouraging the audience to be more extrovert in their reactions gave me additional energy and inspiration to perform. Overall, taking the time to reflect on the different elements of the performance and make deliberate choices according to what would fit me and the specif-

ic repertoire, instead of reproducing a generic format, allowed me to have a better experience performing.

Results

Approaching HIP as an ongoing action and practice had two outcomes: firstly, to unmask the untruths lying in widely accepted stereotypes (Dogantan-Dack, 2015) and secondly, as an inspiration for alternative models (Rolfhamre, 2022), to reimagine the future of the performance of art songs.

My project is a small contribution towards challenging the expectations and norms of the art song recital, but it has been a fundamental step to question my own assumptions on what it means to perform that repertoire. Starting the doctoral program as a voice student freshly graduated from conservatory I had very strong opinions on the matter, shaped by years of traditional training and being exposed to mainstream classical concerts. The research process forced me to critically examine every choice and the reasons behind them. One of the aspects that I found more interesting and productive is the issue of movement while singing art songs: why is it mostly restricted to a few, often stereotypical, gestures? Many reasons, such as technical limitations or not distracting from the musical work, are possible. However, researchers such as Johnsen (2019) have already demonstrated how dancing and classical singing can happen simultaneously. Embracing the invitation to use HIP as a tool, has also allowed me to reclaim my active role in the creation of a performed musical work. It is incredibly empowering to regain ownership of the performative choices instead of having to adapt one's own artistic identity to fit some standardized model. A model that seems to be reproduced and enforced heedlessly in a sort of vicious circle: audiences are mostly exposed to one version, which is what they come to expect. Thus, it is what the people with decision power keep delivering to them; perhaps in fear of losing public and financial return, or for a very human form of inertia. Consequently, young performers are en-

Concert in Fira, Sandnes. 19 June 2022. Photo: E. Behrens.

Conclusion

In conclusion, using HIP as a creative tool obliged me first off to challenge my own assumptions about the correct way of performing art songs. Secondly, shifting the focus of the historical investigation mainly to the context and format of the OPP provided inspiration to imagine possible alternatives to the standard recital. This different performance format created in turn a more relaxed atmosphere that was conductive to a higher degree of the performer's satisfaction and feeling of success. It would be interesting to develop the study further to include the audience's experience and explore if there is a correlation between their satisfaction and the performer's. Overall, the choice of using HIP as an active practice rather than a goal proved successful in the framework of this project. More research is needed though to investigate further and challenge the stereotypes of classical vocal music performance on a broader scale, in order to move the field towards a more diverse and inclusive future.

As well as working to promote a greater variety of musical styles and composers included in concert programming, it would be desirable in my opinion to also strive for greater diversity in terms of artistic identities and performative choices. There is more than one way to sing classical music and to be a classical singer and my hope is that young performers would not only be allowed but even encouraged to experiment and develop their own identity freely. Many ways to achieve that are possible, and in my project I showed how HIP could be one of them. When applied actively to the phenomenon of music in its entirety (both as score AND performance), HIP allows the performer to experience firsthand how the performance practice of art songs have a much more diverse tradition then what we usually assume. We could even say that HIP has the potential to free our notion of the art song performance from the strict codes imposed by the 'performance police'.

couraged by Leech-Wilkinson's "performing police" (2012) to conform to that stereotype with the promise of success. Finally, educational institutions continue to propose the same model to their students. And so, the system keeps feeding itself.

In encountering this system performers are faced with a choice: to follow the rules and stay within the strict codes of the art song recital or break them and imagine new possible formats. The first choice might (or not) bring them recognition, a position and maybe success. The second might on the other hand afford them the dreaded label

or not being a "serious" musician. But if we wish for a future where classical music allows more freedom and diversity and stays relevant to a larger portion of society, the system must adapt and evolve. After all, challenging the tradition and experimenting is how western art music has progressed through the centuries. I daresay that we wouldn't have had some of the great composers and performers that shaped the course of musical history, as well as our current idea of style and taste, if they all had kept making music the way they were supposed to. And Satie is a great example of one such composer.

Augestad, T. (n.d.). Tora Augestad. https://www.toraaugestad.no/biography

Bannerman, B. (Ed.). (1989). The Singer as Interpreter: Claire Croiza's Master Classes (B. Bannerman, Trans.). Victor Gollancz.

Bathori, J. (1998). On the Interpretation of the Mélodies of Claude Debussy (L. Laurent, Trans.). Pendragon Press.

Behrens, E. (2022). Afternoon Tea by Ingeborg Anzjøn at Fira, Sandnes [Photograph]. Private collection.

Behrens, E (2022). Concert in a private home, Randaberg. 22 August 2022 [Photograph]. Private collection.

Behrens, E. (2022). Concert in Fira, Sandnes. 19 June 2022 [Photograph]. Private collection.

Behrens, E. (2022). Concert in Ramsland stuen, Stavanger. 23 August 2022 [Photograph]. Private collection.

Behrens, E. (2022). Concert in Villa Tou, Tau. 22 May 2022 [Photograph]. Private collection.

Behrens, E. (2022). Tapestry by Frida Hansen, reproduction [Photograph]. Private collection.

Bernac, P. (1978). The interpretation of French song. Norton.

Butt, J. (2001). Authenticity. In Grove Music Online. Oxford University Press. https://doi.org/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.46587

Butt, J. (2015). What is a 'musical work'? Reflections on the origins of the 'work concept' in western art music. Concepts of Music and Copyright, 1–22. https://www.elgaronline.com/view/edcoll/9781783478187/9781783478187.00006.xml

Cook, N. (2001). Between Process and Product: Music and/as Performance. Music Theory Online, 7(2). https://mtosmt.org/issues/mto.01.7.2/mto.01.7.2.cook.html
Dahl, P. (2021). Modes of Communication in Stravinsky's Works: Sign and Expression. Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003218463

Dahl, P. (2021). Modes of Communication in Stravinsky's Works: Sign and Expression. Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003218463

Dalheim, I. (2021). Ingeborg Dalheim: Baklengs ut av grammofonen. NMH. https://nmh.no/forskning/prosjekter/ingeborg-dalheim-phdprosjekt-ku
Davis, M. E. (2007). Erik Satie. Reaktion Books.

Debussy, C. (1988). Debussy on Music: The Critical Writings of the Great French Composer Claude Debussy (R. L. Smith, Trans.).

nar presentation abstract]. CMPCP/IMR Performance/Research Seminars, London, United Kingdom. https://www.cmpcp.ac.uk/events/cmpcpimr-seminars/series-3/

Doğantan-Dack, M. (2015). Artistic Research in Classical Music Performance. Parse Journal, Judgement(1), 27–40. https://parsejournal.com/article/artistic-research-in-classical-music-performance/

Eike, B. (2022, September 22). First Person: Violinist and music director Bjarte Eike on bringing the Playhouse to his "Alehouse Sessions." Theartsdesk.Com. https://theartsdesk.com/classical-music/first-person-violinist-and-music-director-bjarte-eike-bringing-playhouse-his

Elliott, M. (2006). French Mélodies. In Singing in Style: A Guide to Vocal Performance Practices. Yale University Press.

Faure, J.-B. (1886). La Voix et le chant, traité pratique, par J. Faure. H. Heugel.

Fischer-Lichte, E. (2008). The Transformative Power of Performance: A New Aesthetics (S. I. Jain, Trans.) Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203894989

frankågunnar. (n.d.). Frankågunnar. Home. https://www.frankagunnar.com/

Garden, M., & Biancolli, L. L. (1951). Mary Garden's Story. Simon and Schuster.

Goehr, L. (1994). The Imaginary Museum of Musical Works: An Essay in the Philosophy of Music. Oxford University Press. https://doi.org/10.1093/0198235410.001.0001

Hahn, R. (2003). On Singers and Singing (L. Simoneau, Trans.). Amadeus Press.

Johnsen, S. M. A. (2019). En søken etter en utvidet fysisk tolkning av vokal samtidsmusikk og av opera [Kunsthøgskolen i Oslo]. https://www.researchcatalogue.net/view/514354/514355

Loges, N., & Tunbridge, L. (Eds.). (2020). German Song Onstage: Lieder Performance in the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries. Indiana University Press. https://doi.org/10.2307/j.ctv104t9zt

Long, M. (1973). At the Piano with Ravel. Dent.

Kania, A. (2017). The Philosophy of Music. In E. N. Zalta (Ed.), The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy (Fall 2017). Metaphysics Research Lab, Stanford University. https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2017/entries/music/

Kerman, J. (1985). The historical performance movement. In Musicology. Fontana Press/Collins.

Kornstad, H. (2021). Discover. HÅKON KORN-

STAD. https://www.kornstad.com/bio.html

Lawson, C., & Stowell, R. (1999). The historical performance of music: An introduction. Cambridge University Press. https://doi.org/10.1017/cbo9780511481710

Leech-Wilkinson, D. (1984). "What We Are Doing with Early Music Is Genuinely Authentic to Such a Small Degree That the Word Loses Most of Its Intended Meaning." Early Music, 12(1), 13–16. https://doi.org/10.1093/earlyj/12.1.13

Leech-Wilkinson, D. (2012). Compositions, Scores, Performances, Meanings. Music Theory Online, 18(1). https://doi.org/10.30535/mto.18.1.4
Madison, G., & Schiölde, G. (2017). Repeated Listening Increases the Liking for Music Regardless of Its Complexity: Implications for the Appreciation and Aesthetics of Music. Frontiers in Neuroscience, 11. https://doi.org/10.3389/fnins.2017.00147

Makomaska, S. (2019). Erik Satie – the 'progenitor' of muzak or the precursor of 'pipedown' movement? On the concept of musique d'ameublement. Interdisciplinary Studies in Musicology, 19, 135–145. https://doi.org/10.14746/ism.2019.19.9

Mellers, W. H. (1942). Erik Satie and the "Problem" of Contemporary Music. Music & Letters, 23(3), 210–227. https://doi.org/10.1093/ml/xxiii.3.210
Mucha, E. (2018). Art Sung – where music, art and narrative meet. Art Sung. http://www.artsung.com/

Myers, R. H. (1968). Erik Satie. Dover Publications.

Neher, E. (2011). The Art Song Recital in Review. The Hudson Review, 64(2), 325–330. https://www.jstor.org/stable/41300671
Orledge, R. (1984). Satie's Approach to Composition in His Later Years (1913-24). Proceedings of the Royal Musical Association, 111, 155–179. https://doi.org/10.1093/jrma/111.1.155
Orledge, R. (1990). Satie the Composer. Cambridge University Press.
Orledge, R. (Ed.). (1995). Satie Remembered (1st Edition). Faber & Faber.

Orledge, R. (2020). Satie, Erik. Oxford Music Online. https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000040105;jsessionid=A24B44D4DBF667C917C6A9D24AB2A-D7A

Perloff, N. (1993). Art and the Everyday: Popular Entertainment and the Circle of Erik Satie. Oxford University Press.

Potter, C. (2015). Erik Satie's "musique d'ameublement" and Max Jacob's "Ruffian toujours, truand jamais." Revue de Musicologie, 101(2), Article 2. https://eprints.kingston.ac.uk/id/eprint/33420/

Potter, C. (2016). Erik Satie: A Parisian Composer and his World. The Boydell Press.

Poulenc, F. (1989). Diary of My Songs. Gollancz.

Radbourne, J., Johanson, K., Glow, H., & White, T. (2009). The Audience Experience: Measuring Quality in the Performing Arts. International Journal of Arts Management, 11(3), 16–29. http://www.jstor.org/stable/41064995

Rivers, N. A., & Weber, R. P. (2011). Ecological, Pedagogical, Public Rhetoric. College Composition and Communication, 63(2), 187–218. https://www.jstor.org/stable/23131582

Rolfhamre, R. (2022). Performative Musicology and HIP as Rhetoric and Pedagogy for the Past in Present and Future. In R. Rolfhamre & E. Angelo (Eds.), Views on Early Music as Representation – Invitations, Congruity, Performance (pp. 21–95). Kappelen Damm Akademisk. https://doi.org/10.23865/noasp.157

Satie, E. (n.d.). Trois mélodies [Recorded by J. Bathori & D. Milhaud]. In Hommage à Jane Bathori. Columbia.
Satie, E. (1949a). Je te veux [Recorded by J. Tourel & G. Reeves]. In A French Song Recital. Columbia Masterworks.

Satie, E. (1949b). Le chapelier [Recorded by J. Tourel & G. Reeves]. In A French Song Recital. Columbia Masterworks.

Satie, E. (1954a). Trois chansons [Recorded by Colinette]. In Hommage à Erik Satie. Le Chant du Monde.
Satie, E. (1954b). Trois mélodies [Recorded by C. Castelli & H. Boschi]. In Hommage à Erik Satie. Le Chant du Monde.

Satie, E. (1967). Trois mélodies [Recorded by P. Bernac & F. Poulenc]. In A Recital by Pierre Bernac, Francis Poulenc. Odyssey.

Satie, E. (1974). Trois mélodies [Recorded by J. Tourel & L. Bernstein]. In Jennie Tourel—Leonard Bernstein at Carnegie Hall. Columbia.
Satie, E. (2012). Je te veux [Recorded by Y. Georges & J. Wiener]. In Deluxe: Moulin Rouge, vol. 1. Puzzle Production. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SGVGirk8-xE-&ab_channel=Chansons%2CFolkloreetVari%C3%A9t%C3%A9

Stravinsky, I. (1959). Poetics of Music in the Form of Six Lessons (A. Knodel & I. Dahl, Trans.).
Vintage Books.

Taruskin, R. (1995). Text and Act: Essays on Music and Performance. Oxford University Press.

Van Den Bosch, I., Salimpoor, V., & Zatorre, R. (2013). Familiarity mediates the relationship between emotional arousal and pleasure during music listening. Frontiers in Human Neuroscience, 7. https://doi.org/10.3389/fn-hum.2013.00534

Whiting, S. M. (1999). Satie the Bohemian: From Cabaret to Concert Hall. Clarendon Press.

Appendix A

En spasertur rundt Montmartre med Erik Satie – concert program

La Diva de l'empire (1904)
Lyrics by Dominique Bonnaud and Numa Blès

Sylvie (1886)
Poem by J.P. Contamine de Latour

Quatre petites melodies (1920)
Élégie: poem by Alphonse de Lamartine

Danseuse: poem by Jean Cocteau
Chanson à boire: anonymous 18th century

Adieu: poem by Raymond Radiguet
Tendrement (1902)

Lyrics by Vincent Hyspa
Trois melodies (1916)

La statue de bronze: poem by Léon-Paul Fargue

Daphénéo: poem by M. God
Le chapelier: poem by René Chalupt after Lewis Carroll

Je te veux (1897)
Lyrics by Henry Pacory

Ludions (1923): poems by Léon-Paul Fargue
Air du rat
Spleen
La grenouille américaine
Air du poète
Chanson du chat

Allons-y chochotte (1905)
Lyrics by D. Durante

**Appendix B
Interview script**

To be videorecorded the same day of the performance. Length 5/10 min. It is not necessary to look straight into the camera.

·   What is your overall feeling of the performance? How did you feel throughout the performance (in control, anxious, relaxed, enjoying it, overwhelmed, surprised...)? How did you feel after the performance was finished? (satisfied, disappointed...)

·   How was the performance in comparison to the rehearsals? (it went more or less as planned, it was completely different from how we rehearsed/planned it, it went better than expected...)? Did you have some sudden new insights? What?

·   What is your impression of the audience response (they were attentive, they were distracted, they enjoyed it, they seemed confused...)? Did you notice any reaction in particular (laughing, gasping, yawning, talking...)? Or any spontaneous comment/question after the performance?

·   Was there anything that happened during this performance that you are planning on incorporating in the future performances? (something that needs to be changed, added, scrapped...)
·   How did the performance score (none, poor, satisfying, good, very good) on these parameters:

1.   Authenticity (of the performers as perceived by the performers, as perceived by the audience)
2.   Collective engagement (between performers, between members of the audience, between performers and audience)

·   Anything else you would like to add?